

Mains Practice Question

Case Studies

You are posted as the District Magistrate in a prominent pilgrimage town in North India that attracts lakhs of devotees every year during a major festival. On the main day of the event, a tragic stampede occurs near the entry gates of the temple complex, leading to the death of over 50 devotees and injuring hundreds. Preliminary reports indicate that poor crowd management, inadequate barricading, and negligence in traffic diversion contributed to the chaos.

Eyewitnesses reveal that local vendors had illegally encroached upon key passageways, while influential religious organisations resisted stricter crowd-control measures citing "devotee inconvenience." Political leaders had also pressured the administration to allow maximum entry, as restrictions would upset religious sentiments before elections.

Your internal inquiry shows lapses at multiple levels: police and civic officials ignored standard operating procedures for crowd control, corruption was involved in issuing special entry passes for VIPs, and emergency medical response was delayed due to poor coordination between the health department and local NGOs.

The media has labelled the incident a "man-made disaster," while families of victims demand accountability and justice. An inquiry commission is to be set up, and you are tasked with preparing a comprehensive report and action plan to prevent such tragedies in the future.

- A. Identify and discuss the ethical issues involved in this case.
- B. How would you balance religious sentiments, political pressure, and your responsibility to ensure public safety?
- C. How would you ensure accountability among officials and fairness to victims?
- D. Suggest key measures for long-term prevention of stampedes and state the ethical values that should guide you. (250 words)
 - 22 Aug, 2025 GS Paper 4 Case Studies

Approach:

- Briefly describe the situation to establish context.
- Identify and discuss the ethical issues involved in this case.
- Discuss the steps to balance religious sentiments, political pressure, and public safety.
- Highlight the mechanisms to ensure accountability among officials and fairness to victims.
- Suggest key measures for long-term prevention of stampedes and state the ethical values that should guide you.
- Conclude with a suitable way forward.

Introduction:

The tragic stampede during a major pilgrimage highlights how administrative negligence, political interference, and disregard for safety norms can convert faith into disaster. It is a manmade tragedy involving ethical lapses at multiple levels, demanding accountability, justice for victims, and systemic reforms.

Body:

A. Ethical Issues Involved

- Negligence of Duty Police and civic officials ignored Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) on crowd management.
- **Corruption** VIP passes issued illegally compromised fairness and equality.
- **Conflict of Values** Political and religious pressure undermined administrative impartiality.
- Violation of Human Dignity Inadequate medical response denied victims timely care.
- Encroachment & Public Inconvenience Vendors, allowed due to negligence, blocked critical pathways.
- Transparency and Accountability Deficit Failure to enforce responsibility before and after the incident.

B. Balancing Religious Sentiments, Political Pressure, and Public Safety

- **Primacy of Safety:** Right to life (Article 21) must override political expediency or religious convenience.
- Respectful Dialogue: Religious leaders can be engaged through persuasion, explaining that
 effective crowd control is in devotees' best interest.
- Rule of Law over Political Pressure: Political leaders must be reminded that accountability for violations will rest with the administration.
- Emotional Intelligence: Decisions communicated with empathy reduce resistance.
 - Example: setting up waiting halls, live telecasts, and staggered entry to maintain faith while ensuring safety.

C. Ensuring Accountability and Fairness

- Accountability of Officials:
 - Fix responsibility for negligence through impartial inquiry.
 - Initiate disciplinary action, including suspension, if SOP violations or corruption are proven.
- Fairness to Victims:
 - Immediate compensation and free medical care.
 - Counselling for families and rehabilitation for dependents.
 - Transparent grievance redressal, avoiding bureaucratic delays.
- Public Communication:
 - Transparent reporting to the media and public to maintain trust.

D. Long-term Preventive Measures & Ethical Values

Preventive Measures:

- Strict SOP Implementation: Demarcated entry/exit points, proper barricading, and traffic diversion.
- **Technology Integration:** CCTV, drones, Al-based crowd density alerts.
- Capacity Regulation: Pre-registration, e-passes, and staggered timings.
- Volunteer & Police Training: Crowd psychology, emergency drills, disaster management.
- Inter-agency Coordination: Joint command centre with health, police, fire, NGOs.
- Independent Audits: Safety audits before every festival, accountability reports after.

Guiding Ethical Values:

- Integrity resisting corruption and undue influence.
- Accountability fixing responsibility for lapses.

- **Compassion** humane treatment of victims.
- **Courage of Conviction** standing firm against political/religious pressure.
- Justice & Fairness equal treatment for all devotees.
- Public Service Orientation prioritising citizens' safety above all.

Conclusion:

Guided by **Kant's deontological ethics**, which emphasises duty and respect for human dignity, public officials must act not out of convenience or pressure but from the moral obligation to protect life. Thus, governance must embody both **administrative efficiency and ethical responsibility**, ensuring that religious fervour never overshadows the **right to safety and justice**.

