

# **Constitutional Morality**

For Prelims: Constitutional morality, Pillars of Constitutional Morality, Conditional Morality and Indian Constitution, <u>Directive Principles of State Policy</u>, Fundamental Rights, <u>Amended IT Rules 2023</u>, <u>Appointment Committee for the Election Commission</u>

**For Mains:** Challenges to Constitutional Morality in India, Judicial Pronouncements Related to Constitutional Morality in India.

#### Source: IE

## Why in News?

The recent arrest of a serving chief minister on corruption charges raises legal, political, and constitutional concerns and poses questions about its consistency with <u>constitutional morality</u>, especially in a parliamentary democracy like India.

## What is Constitutional Morality?

- About:
  - Constitutional morality (CM) is a concept that refers to the principles and values underlying a constitution that guide the actions of both the government and the citizenry.
    - The concept of constitutional morality was propounded by the British Classicist George Grote in the 19<sup>th</sup> century.
      - He described CM as a "paramount reverence for the forms of the Constitution" of the land.
    - In India, the term was first used by <u>Dr. B.R. Ambedkar.</u>
- Pillars of Constitutional Morality:
  - Constitutional Values: Upholding the core values enshrined in the Constitution, such as
    justice, liberty, equality, fraternity, secularism, and the dignity of the individual.
  - Rule of Law: Upholding the supremacy of the law where everyone, including government officials, is subject to and accountable under the law.
  - Democratic Principles: Ensuring the functioning of a representative democracy where citizens have the right to participate in decision-making processes and hold their elected representatives accountable.
  - **Fundamental Rights:** Respecting and protecting the fundamental rights guaranteed by the constitution, such as the <u>right to equality</u>, <u>freedom of speech and expression</u>, <u>right to life and personal liberty</u>, **etc.**
  - <u>Separation of Powers:</u> Maintaining the separation and balance of powers between the legislative, executive, and judicial branches of government to prevent any one branch from becoming too powerful.
  - **Checks and Balances**: Establishing mechanisms and institutions that provide checks and balances to prevent abuse of power and protect the rights of individuals.
  - Constitutional Interpretation: Interpreting the constitution in a manner that promotes

**its underlying principles** and values while adapting to changing societal needs and circumstances.

- **Ethical Governance:** Ensuring **ethical conduct in governance,** transparency, accountability, and integrity in public service.
- Conditional Morality and Indian Constitution:
  - The term "constitutional morality" is not explicitly mentioned in the Indian Constitution.
    - However, the concept is inherent in the document's core principles, emphasising values like justice, equality, and liberty.
    - These principles are found throughout the constitution, including the Preamble,
       Fundamental Rights, and <u>Directive Principles of State Policy.</u>
  - Its essence is also reflected in various Supreme Court judgements.
- Judgments Upholding Constitutional Morality:
  - Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala, 1973: This case established the "basic structure doctrine," which essentially limits Parliament's power to amend the Constitution and ensures its core principles remain intact.
    - This can be seen as an early instance of the court upholding the spirit of the Constitution.
  - **SP Gupta Case (First Judges Case), 1982:** The Supreme Court labelled a constitutional breach as a severe violation of constitutional morality.
  - Naz Foundation v. Government of NCT of Delhi, 2009: This judgment decriminalised consensual same-sex relationships between adults.
    - The court emphasised that "constitutional morality" should prevail over societal perceptions of morality, upholding individual rights.
  - Manoj Narula v. Union of India, 2014: SC stated that "Constitutional Morality means to bow down to the norms of the Constitution and not act in a manner which would become violative of the rule of law of action in an arbitrary manner.
  - Indian Young Lawyers Association v. State of Kerala (Sabarimala Case), 2018: The
    court struck down the practice of excluding women of a certain age group from the
    Sabarimala temple.
    - It emphasised that "constitutional morality" includes principles of justice, equality, liberty, and fraternity, which outweighed religious customs restricting women's entry.
  - Navtej Singh Johar v. Union of India, 2018: This case read down Section 377 of the Indian Penal Code, which criminalised homosexuality.
- Challenges to Constitutional Morality in India:
  - **Political Interference:** One of the significant challenges is political interference in the functioning of constitutional bodies and institutions.
    - This interference can undermine the autonomy and impartiality of these institutions, affecting their ability to uphold constitutional values.
    - For example, there has been criticism surrounding the recent changes to the appointment committee for the Election Commission of India and the amended IT Rules 2023.
  - Judicial Activism vs. Judicial Restraint: Balancing judicial activism with judicial restraint is another challenge.
    - While judicial activism can promote the protection of rights and enforcement of constitutional values, excessive activism can encroach upon the domain of the executive and legislature.
  - **Enforcement and Compliance:** Despite having a robust constitutional framework, ensuring effective enforcement and compliance remains a challenge.
    - Implementation gaps, delays in justice delivery, and lack of awareness about constitutional rights among the general populace contribute to this challenge.

### **Way Forward**

- Strengthening Institutions: Upholding constitutional morality necessitates strengthening the independence, integrity, and effectiveness of institutions such as the Election Commission, National Investigation Agency (NIA) and Central Bureau of Investigation (CBI).
  - Ensuring transparent appointments, reducing political interference, and enhancing accountability mechanisms are critical steps.

- **Promoting Civic Education:** Increasing awareness and understanding of constitutional rights and values among the public, especially youth, is vital.
  - Civic education programs in schools and colleges can instil a sense of constitutional responsibility and empower citizens to participate meaningfully in democratic processes.
- Enhancing Access to Justice: Improving access to justice, particularly for marginalised and vulnerable communities, is essential for upholding constitutional principles.
  - This includes expanding legal aid services, reducing judicial backlog, simplifying legal procedures, and promoting alternative dispute resolution mechanisms.
- **Encouraging Ethical Leadership:** Promoting ethical leadership and governance practices at all levels is vital for upholding constitutional values.
  - Leaders and public officials should **demonstrate integrity, accountability, and a commitment** to serving the public interest, thereby setting a positive example for society.
- Adapting to Evolving Challenges: Continuously adapting legal and institutional frameworks to address emerging challenges to constitutional morality, such as technological advancements, globalisation, and environmental concerns, is necessary for relevance and effectiveness.

## Do Chief Ministers in India Lack Immunity from Arrests?

- Constitutionally, only the <u>President of India</u> and <u>Governors</u> of states enjoy immunity from civil and criminal proceedings until the conclusion of their terms.
  - Article 361 of the Constitution stipulates that these officials are not liable to any court for acts performed in the discharge of their official duties.
- However, this immunity does not extend to Prime Ministers or Chief Ministers, who are subject to the principle of equality before the law as advocated by the Constitution.
  - Despite this, arrest alone does not warrant disqualification.

#### **Drishti Mains Question:**

Q. Assess the contemporary challenges to constitutional morality in India, considering factors such as judicial activism.

### **UPSC Civil Services Examination Previous Year's Questions (PYQs)**

#### **Mains:**

**Q:** What is meant by the term 'constitutional morality'? How does one uphold constitutional morality? **(2019)** 

PDF Refernece URL: https://www.drishtiias.com/printpdf/constitutional-mrality