



Mains Practice Question

Case Study

You are the Superintendent of Police (SP) of a district where panchayat elections are being held. The elections have been marred by widespread violence, resulting in several deaths and injuries. The ruling party and the opposition parties have accused each other of rigging, intimidation and booth capturing. The State Election Commission (SEC) has sought your report on the situation and asked you to take necessary steps to ensure free and fair elections.

One of the major sources of violence in your district is a notorious Bahubali Neta (muscleman leader) who belongs to the ruling party and has several criminal cases against him. He is contesting the elections from his stronghold and has allegedly unleashed his goons to terrorize his rivals and voters. He also enjoys the patronage of some influential politicians and religious leaders who have appealed to their followers to vote for him.

- a) What are the ethical issues involved in this case?
- b) What are the options available to you as the SP? Evaluate each option in terms of its merits and demerits.
- c) What course of action would you take as the SP? Justify your decision with suitable reasons.

07 Jul, 2023 GS Paper 4 Case Studies

Approach:

- **Introduction:** Start your answer with introducing the case
- **Body:** Mention ethical issue involved, options available and course of action along with justification.
- **Conclusion:** Summarize and conclude your answer.

Introduction:

The situation described poses significant ethical challenges for the Superintendent of Police (SP) in ensuring free and fair panchayat elections in the district. The presence of a notorious Bahubali Neta, violence, and allegations of rigging and intimidation demand a principled and decisive response.

Body:

a) Ethical issues involved in this case include:

- **Fairness and impartiality:**
 - Ensuring that the elections are conducted fairly and without any bias towards any political party or individual is crucial.
 - The presence of a notorious Bahubali Neta with criminal cases against him creates an imbalance and undermines the fairness of the electoral process.
- **Rule of law:**

- Upholding the rule of law is essential for maintaining a democratic society.
- The Bahubali Neta's use of violence and intimidation tactics violates the principles of law and order and threatens the safety and rights of citizens.
- **Accountability and transparency:**
 - As the SP, there is a responsibility to ensure transparency in the electoral process.
 - Any form of rigging, booth capturing, or intimidation compromises the accountability of the election and erodes public trust in the democratic system.
- **Impartial enforcement:**
 - It is crucial to address the influence and patronage enjoyed by the Bahubali Neta from influential politicians and religious leaders. Upholding impartiality in enforcing the law, regardless of political affiliations or influence, is necessary to maintain the integrity of the electoral process.
- **Public safety and security:**
 - The widespread violence resulting in deaths and injuries poses a significant ethical concern.
 - Protecting the safety and security of citizens is a fundamental duty, and failure to address the violence could lead to further harm and erosion of public trust.

b) The options available to me as the SP are:

- **Option 1:** To ignore or overlook the activities of the Bahubali Neta and his goons, fearing his clout and influence in the district.
 - **Merits:**
 - This option may avoid any direct confrontation or conflict with the Bahubali Neta and his supporters.
 - It may also prevent any backlash or retaliation from them that may endanger my life or career.
 - **Demerits:**
 - This option may violate the rule of law and encourage violence and malpractices during the elections.
 - It may also deprive the voters, candidates and election staff of their democratic rights.
 - It may also erode the credibility and integrity of the police as a responsible and impartial agency for conducting elections.
- **Option 2:** To take strict action against the Bahubali Neta and his goons, irrespective of their political affiliation or influence.
 - **Merits:**
 - This option may uphold the rule of law and maintain public order by preventing and controlling violence during the elections.
 - It may also ensure the democratic rights of the voters, candidates and election staff by conducting free and fair elections.
 - It may also assert the authority and integrity of the police as a responsible and impartial agency for conducting elections.
 - **Demerits:**
 - This option may face opposition or backlash from the ruling party or the Bahubali Neta and his supporters who may accuse the police of bias or high-handedness. It may also escalate the violence or conflict between different parties or groups.
 - It may also require courage and commitment from the police to act against powerful or influential persons or groups.
- **Option 3:** To negotiate with the Bahubali Neta and persuade him to refrain from violence or malpractices during the elections, assuring him of a fair chance to contest.
 - **Merits:**
 - This option may reduce the violence or tension in the district by appealing to the Bahubali Neta's sense of reason or self-interest.
 - It may also create a conducive atmosphere for holding free and fair elections.
 - It may also maintain the cooperation and coordination between the police, district administration and SEC for conducting elections.
 - **Demerits:**
 - This option may face resistance or reluctance from the Bahubali Neta who may

have other political or criminal motives for indulging in violence or malpractices.

- It may also require compromise or concession from the police that may affect their integrity or impartiality.
- It may also create a perception of distrust or interference in the election process by other parties or groups.

▪ **Option 4:** Seek support from paramilitary forces:

◦ **Merits:**

- Collaborating with paramilitary forces can provide additional manpower, expertise, and firepower to tackle the volatile situation effectively.
- Their presence could deter potential troublemakers.

◦ **Demerits:**

- Coordinating with paramilitary forces may take time and require logistical arrangements.
- It may also escalate tensions if their deployment is perceived as excessive or heavy-handed.

▪ **Option 5:** Engage in dialogue with influential stakeholders:

◦ **Merits:**

- Initiating a dialogue with influential politicians and religious leaders could help mitigate their support for the Bahubali Neta.
- It may be possible to persuade them to prioritize the democratic process over personal interests.

◦ **Demerits:**

- The success of dialogue depends on the willingness of these stakeholders to engage and their commitment to upholding democratic principles.
- There is a risk of negotiations being unsuccessful or being perceived as compromising with powerful interests.

c) Course of action as the SP:

▪ **Increase Police Presence and Deployment:**

- Strengthen security measures at polling booths and other vulnerable areas by deploying additional police personnel.
- Ensure that the deployment is done impartially, focusing on areas with a history of violence and intimidation.

▪ **Collaborate with Paramilitary Forces:**

- Seek support from paramilitary forces to enhance the security arrangements. Coordinate with them to ensure an effective and visible presence, while also providing necessary training to the police personnel for better management of the situation.

▪ **Establish a Dedicated Helpline:**

- Set up a dedicated helpline for citizens to report any instances of violence or intimidation.
- Publicize the helpline number widely to encourage people to come forward and provide information, assuring them of strict confidentiality and protection.

▪ **Conduct a Thorough Investigation:**

- Initiate a comprehensive investigation into the criminal cases against the Bahubali Neta and his goons.
- Gather evidence, identify the perpetrators, and ensure the cases are pursued vigorously, irrespective of their political affiliations.

▪ **Engage in Community Outreach:**

- Conduct awareness campaigns to educate the public about the importance of free and fair elections.
- Organize interactions with community leaders, civil society organizations, and influential individuals to foster a sense of responsibility towards the democratic process.

▪ **Regular Monitoring and Updates:**

- Continuously monitor the situation, especially on polling days, through a combination of on-ground observations and technological tools.
- Provide regular updates to the State Election Commission and other relevant authorities to ensure a coordinated response.

Conclusion:

The ultimate goal is to create an environment where every voter can freely express their choices, where candidates compete on a level playing field, and where the democratic values of fairness, transparency, and accountability prevail. Upholding these principles not only safeguards the integrity of the electoral process but also protects the democratic fabric of the district, fostering trust and harmony among its citizens.

PDF Refernece URL: <https://www.drishtias.com/mains-practice-question/question-7921/pnt>

